

RFP EVALUATION – CMOM

5/3/16

Reviewers: Brian Helminger, Mike Jaeger, Dan Koski, Greg Minikel

Initial discussion and agreement was that all three firms were capable of producing an acceptable CMOM. The scoring for general understanding, project understanding, and firm experience were pretty much equal as the CMOM is well defined in the NR Code and only qualified firms were asked to submit an RFP in the first place. Robert E Lee and Strand's proposals were selected to be scrutinized further as AECOM scored last in all 4 individual reviews and was also the highest cost proposal.

Concerns/Discussion points:

Robert E Lee

- Firm designed and provided construction observation for the 40th and Archer lift station project
- REL Project manager has 34 years' experience but appears to have a road and highway construction background rather than being focused on sewer work
- Level of effort = lowest with firm time of 91.5 hrs with 65 from Project manager
- CMOM experience tends to be with much smaller communities (and collection systems) than Manitowoc (Sister Bay, Luxemburg, Little Chute)
- Lowest cost at \$11980

Strand Associates

- Firm designed (is currently under construction) Horseshoe Drive lift station and is contracted for the WWTF Upgrades that are ongoing
- Project manager has 29 year career dedicated to collection system and sewer work and extensive list of past sewer projects in large communities
- Level of effort = middle with firm time of 120 hrs with 60 from Project manager
- CMOM experience is in comparable sized communities to Manitowoc (Fond du Lac, Grafton, Janesville, Allouez)
- Strand has more recent collection system experience with Manitowoc. Project manager has completed a Capacity study and annual flow monitoring program for the City of Manitowoc
- Includes the development of one SOP which format and development can be duplicated for other SOP's as the City desires to produce in house
- Presentations included in proposal to both WWTF Board and Common Council
- Potential to have less City staff time involved since Strand has the most recent experience and copies of all recent work done in Manitowoc
- Middle cost proposal at \$19370 City can shave off \$4040 if presentations are not desired

Recommendation: Reviewers unanimously recommend selection of Strand Associates for the CMOM program development. Proposals and individual scoring sheets on file and available for review if desired.